

Spring 2014  
RLG465/2043

## Buddhism as Translation

Time: Mondays, 10am-12pm

Place: JHB317

Instructor: Christoph Emmrich

Email: christoph.emmrich@utoronto.ca

Office: Centre for the Study of Religion, 170 St. George St.,

Jackman Humanities Building, Room 303

Office hours: by appointment

### A. Description and guidelines

#### Course description

In terms of both idiom, volume and time span, Buddhist texts are arguably the most widely translated texts in the world. This process of ongoing transfer and reformulation spans from the Middle Indic languages in the early centuries BCE to the 'classical' Buddhist languages such as Sanskrit, Tibetan and Chinese, including most 'big' East, South, Southeast Asian and European tongues and many less well-known languages such as Mon, Newar or Tocharian. It is in these shifts that both the continuities and the discontinuities of Buddhism have been reinscribed into its very textual fabric. In that sense, Buddhism has been forever both lost and found, and in fact may have never existed anywhere else than, in translation. We will try to understand why, how and at what cost these efforts were made, identify the linguistics and the logistics, the conflicts and the hermeneutics involved and ask what happened to Buddhism in the process. This course will take a peep into the Buddhist translator's workshop and confront the insights gained there with new theories that have emerged out of the current theoretical interest in translation.

#### Requirements

This course will be conducted as a seminar. In order to be graded, students must prepare the reading assignments in due time, attend classes regularly, participate actively in the sessions, prepare one extensively annotated translation and submit one essay.

#### In-class participation

The weekly reading assignments consist of book sections or articles covering a specific topic that must be read ahead of the session in which this topic will be discussed. Please check the Course Calendar below to find out which book or articles should be prepared for each session. In addition to a constant participation in in-class discussions, each student should prepare a minimum of 3 questions or critical remarks relating to the material read for each session. Students will be expected to independently raise these questions or make these remarks and react to comments made by other members of the class. The instructor will take notes on the quality of these oral contributions.

### Annotated translation

The first written assignment consists in the translation of a short passage of a Buddhist text in an Asian language of the student's choice into English. The specific passage and its length should be chosen in consultation with the instructor the latest by midterm. The translation must be completed by the last session. The translation should contain the original text and be done in a double format: (1) a literal translation followed by (2) a polished, literary translation. The translation should be accompanied by (1) footnotes explaining your choices regarding those words and passages where alternative translations would have been possible, (2) an accompanying text in which the student explains how the style of his or her literary translation is justified by and is representative of his or her reading of the passage as a whole and, more generally, which approach to translation the student has chosen and how that too may be reflected in the final product. The last session will be dedicated to the oral presentation by each student of the annotated translation and the accompanying methodological reflections.

### Essay

For the final take home-essay (15-20 pages) students should choose one from among various topics which should be proposed, discussed and specified in coordination with the course instructor around mid-term. Students may suggest a theme according to their individual interests. This could be a particular text they have found challenging, a question which has come up in one of the readings, presentations, talks or discussions, or a topic you would like to explore more in detail. The research essay has to be turned in one week after the final day of class as a printout. Possible extensions to the deadline should be discussed with the course instructor well in advance. It is advisable to have at least one meeting with the course instructor to discuss the bibliography, the outline of your essay, your work in progress or receive feedback on a draft. However, keep in mind the deadline, so that you are able to incorporate advice in time. The course instructor will be glad to offer assistance in deciding on the relevant topic, material or method and discuss your thoughts and writing.

It is crucial for written assignments that everything you produce has been either formulated by yourself or marked and referenced as a quotation if you use materials you have taken from a source. As UofT has adopted a firm stance on the issue of plagiarism, please be aware that, if detected, the course instructor has the duty to report them to university authorities.

There will be no exams, quizzes or tests.

### Evaluation

1. regular attendance and the active and informed participation in class before drop date: 15%
2. regular attendance and the active and informed participation in class after drop date: 5%
3. annotated translation and presentation: 30%
4. one final research essay of 15-20 pages: 50%

### Course grading scheme

#### Undergraduate

A+	90-100%	B+	77-79%	C+	67-69%	D+	57-59%
A	85-89%	B	73-76%	C	63-66%	D	53-56%
A-	80-84%	B-	70-72%	C-	60-62%	D-	50-52%

F 0-49%

Graduate

A+ 90-100%

B+ 77-79%

F 0-69%

A 85-89%

B 73-76%

A- 80-84%

B- 70-72%

#### Interaction with the course instructor

Address all your requests and queries about the course to the course instructor. Use your [utoronto.ca](mailto:utoronto.ca) mail address. The mail header should identify the course so that your mail can be quickly identified.

Though incoming mails are viewed on a daily basis and though the course instructor will try to address your issues as swiftly as possible, it may take up to three days for the instructor to reply to your mail, so do wait for that period before reacting and do mail in time if you have any urgent requests. Prearrange meetings by email so that they can be scheduled upon request.

## B. Schedule and topics

### I. Jan 6, 2014: Introduction

### II. Jan. 13, 2014: Into Vernacular Chinese, Japanese, Korean, Newar, Burmese.

#### Required readings for all:

- Mair, Victor H. 1994. "Buddhism and the Rise of the Written Vernacular in East Asia: The Making of National Languages." *The Journal of Asian Studies* 53, 3 (August 1994): 707-751.
- Malla, Kamal P. *Classical Newari Literature: A Sketch*. Kathmandu: Educational Enterprise, 1982: 18-21 & 35-44.

#### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Okell, John. Nissaya Burmese. A Case of Systematic Adaptation of a Foreign Grammar and Syntax. *Journal of the Burma Research Society*, 50, 1 (1967): 95-123.

#### Recommended readings:

- U Tin Htway. Word-Borrowing and Word-Making in Modern South Asian Languages: Burmese. *Word-Borrowing and Word-Making in Modern South Asian Languages*. Ayyadurai Dhamotharan (ed.). South Asian Digest of Regional Writing, vol. 4 (1975). Heidelberg: Heidelberg University, South Asia Institute: 44-62.
- Zürcher, Erik "Late Han Vernacular Elements in the Earliest Buddhist Translation", *Journal of the Chinese Language Teacher's Association*, 12.2 (1977): 179.

### III. Jan. 20, 2014: Into Chinese

#### Required readings for all:

- Nattier, Jan. A Distant Mirror. Studying Indian Buddhism through Chinese and Tibetan Texts. In: *A Few Good Men. The Bodhisattva Path according to The Inquiry of Ugra (Ugraparipṛcchā)*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2003: 70-72.
- Boucher, Daniel, "Gāndhārī and the Early Chinese Buddhist Translations Reconsidered: the Case of the *Saddharmapuṇḍarikasūtra*", *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 118, no.4 (1998): 471-503.

#### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Bhikkhu Anālayo. The Influence of Commentarial Exegesis on the Transmission of the Āgama Literature. *Translating Buddhist Chinese. Problems and Prospects*. Konrad Meisig (ed.). Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010: 1-20.
- Meisig, Konrad. Buddhist Chinese. Regiolect and Metalanguage. *Translating Buddhist Chinese. Problems and Prospects*. Konrad Meisig (ed.). Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010: 65-74.

#### Recommended readings:

- Bernhard, Franz.. "Gāndhārī and the Buddhist Mission in Central Asia." In *Añjali, Papers on Indology and Buddhism. A Felicitation Volume Presented to Oliver Hector de Alwis Wijesekera on his Sixtieth Birthday*. J. Tilakasiri (ed.). Peradeniya: The Felicitation Volume Editorial Committee, University of Ceylon, 1970.
- Nattier, Jan. Masquerading as Transcription. Substitution Terms in Chinese Buddhist Translations. Paper presented at the Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology. Sōka University, Tōkyō, Japan, 2006.

- Nattier, Jan. *A Guide to the Earliest Chinese Translations. Texts from the Eastern Han and the Three Kingdoms Periods*. Tōkyō: The Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism. Sōka University, 2008.
- Pulleyblank, E. G. 1983. Stages in the Transcription of Indian Words in Chinese from Han to Tang. *Sprachen des Buddhismus in Zentralasien*. Klaus Röhrborn and Wolfgang Veenker, eds. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz: 73-102.

#### IV. Jan. 27, 2014: Into Tibetan

##### Required readings for all:

- Davidson, Ronald M. *Tibetan Renaissance. Tantric Buddhism in the Rebirth of Tibetan Culture*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005: 117-128 & 148-160.
- An Imperial Decree on Translation. *Sources of Tibetan Tradition*. Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Matthew T. Kapstein, Gray Tuttle (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 2013: 72-76.
- In Praise of Translators. *Sources of Tibetan Tradition*. Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Matthew T. Kapstein, Gray Tuttle (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 2013: 307-309.

##### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- The Life of the Translator Rinchen Zangpo. *Sources of Tibetan Tradition*. Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Matthew T. Kapstein, Gray Tuttle (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 2013: 173-176.
- Rongzompa's Defense of Nyingma Tantra. *Sources of Tibetan Tradition*. Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Matthew T. Kapstein, Gray Tuttle (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 2013: 186-188.
- The Life of Ngok Loden Sherap, the Translator. *Sources of Tibetan Tradition*. Kurtis R. Schaeffer, Matthew T. Kapstein, Gray Tuttle (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 2013: 380-384.

##### Recommended reading:

- Davidson, Ronald M. *Tibetan Renaissance. Tantric Buddhism in the Rebirth of Tibetan Culture*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005: 117-209.

#### V. Feb. 3, 2014: Into Pāli

##### Required readings for all:

- Norman, Kenneth Roy. "Buddhism and Oral Tradition". *A Philological Approach to Buddhism, The Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai Lectures 1994*. Lancaster: Pali Text Society, 2006: 53-74.
- Norman, Kenneth Roy. "Buddhism and Regional Languages". *A Philological Approach to Buddhism, The Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai Lectures 1994*. Lancaster: Pali Text Society, 2006: 75-97.

##### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Norman, Kenneth Roy. "Buddhism and the Commentarial Tradition". *A Philological Approach to Buddhism, The Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai Lectures 1994*. Lancaster: Pali Text Society, 2006: 195-219.

##### Recommended readings:

- Barrett, T. H. 1992. "Ji Xianlin on the Original Language of Buddhism," *Indo-Iranian Journal* 35: 83-93.
- Bechert, Heinz. "The Writing Down of the Tripitaka in Pāli." *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens* 36 (1992): 45-53.
- Brough, John. "Sakāya Niruttīyā: Cauld kale het." *Die Sprache der ältesten buddhistischen Überlieferung*, Göttingen: Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen, Philologisch-Historische Klasse, Dritte Folge, Nr. 117, 1980: 35-42.
- Hinüber, Oskar von. "Pāli as an Artificial Language." *Indologica Taurinensia* 10 (1982): 133-140. Also published in *Kleine Schriften, Teil 1*, herausgegeben von Harry Falk und Walter Slaje (Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag): 451-458.

- Hinüber, Oskar von. "The Oldest Literary Language of Buddhism." *Saeculum* 34 (1983): 1-9. Also published in *Selected Papers on Pāli Studies* (Oxford: The Pali Text Society, 2005): 177-94.
- Levman, Bryan. "Sakāya niruttīyā Revisited," *Bulletin des Études Indiennes*, 26-27, (2008-2009), 33-51.
- Levman, Bryan. Lexical Ambiguities in the Buddha's Teachings, an Example & Methodology. *International Journal for the Study of Humanistic Buddhism*. 2 (2012), 35-56.
- Norman, Kenneth Roy. "Buddhism and Writing." *A Philological Approach to Buddhism, The Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai Lectures 1994*. Lancaster: Pali Text Society, 2006: 99-121.
- Oberlies, Thomas. "Aśokan Prakrit and Pāli". *The Indo-Aryan Languages*. G. Cardona & D. Jain (eds.) London and New York: Routledge, 2003: 161-203.

## VI. Feb. 10, 2014: Into Sanskrit

### Required readings for all:

- Norman, Kenneth Roy. "Buddhism and Sanskritisation." *A Philological Approach to Buddhism, The Bukkyō Dendō Kyōkai Lectures 1994*. Lancaster: Pali Text Society, 2006: 123-146.
- Salomon, Richard. *Indian Epigraphy. A Guide to the Study of Inscriptions in Sanskrit, Prakrit, and Other Indo-Aryan Languages*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998: 81-86
- Pollock, Sheldon. *The Language of the Gods in the World of Men. Sanskrit, Culture, and Power in Premodern India*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006: 115-134 & 254-256.

### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Hinüber, Oskar von. Origin and Varieties of Buddhist Sanskrit. *Dialectes dans les littératures indo-aryennes: Actes du colloque international*. Paris: Collège de France, Institut de civilisation indienne, 1989, 341-367.

### Recommended readings:

- Chinchore, Mangala. Lost Buddhist Texts: The Rationale of Their Reconstruction in Sanskrit. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995, 119-137.
- Edgerton, Franklin. "The Prakrit Underlying Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit." *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies, University of London* Vol. 8, 2/3 (1936): 501-516.
- Roth, Gustav. "Particular Features of the Language of the Ārya-Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins and their Importance for Early Buddhist Tradition." *The Language of the Earliest Buddhist Tradition*. Heinz Bechert (ed.). Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen, Philologisch-Historische Klasse, Dritte Folge, Nr. 117, 1980: 78-135

## VII. Feb. 24, 2014. Comparative Asian translation

### Required readings for all:

- Ricci, Ronit. On "Translation" and Its Untranslatability. *Islam Translated. Literature, Conversion, and the Arabic Cosmopolis of South and Southeast Asia*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011: 31-65.
- Sakai, Naoki. Writing for Multiple Audiences and the Heterolingual Address. *Translation and Subjectivity. On "Japan" and Cultural Nationalism*. Foreword by Meaghan Morris. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997, 1-17

### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Irani, Ayesha. Identity/Alterity in the Biographical Process. The Case of the Nabīvaṃśa ("The Prophet's Lineage") of Seventeenth-Century Bengal. Paper presented at the Local Islam Conference (Workshop I), Vanderbilt University, September 2013.

**Recommended readings:**

- Liu, Lydia. Preface, & Introduction: The Problem of Language in Cross-Cultural Studies. *Translingual Practice. Literature, National Culture, and Translated Modernity, China 1900-1937*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995: xv-xx, 1-42.

**VIII. Mar. 3, 2014: Classical translation theories****Required readings for all:**

- Goethe, Johann Wolfgang von. Translations. Transl. by Sharon Sloan. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 64-66.
- Benjamin, Walter. The Task of the Translator: An Introduction to the Translation of Baudelaire's *Tableaux Parisiens*. Translated by Harry Zohn. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 75-83.

**Additional required readings for graduate students:**

- Jakobson, Roman. On Linguistic Aspects of Translation. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 138-143.

**Recommended readings:**

- Nida, Eugene. Principles of Correspondence. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: xyz-xyz.
- Quine, Willard van Orman. Meaning and Translation. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: xyz-xyz.

**IX. Mar. 10, 2014: Postmodernist translation theories****Required readings for all:**

- Steiner, George. The Hermeneutic Motion. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 193-198.
- Vermeer, Hans J. Skopos and Commission in Translational Action. Translated by Andrew Chesterman. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 221-232.
- Venuti, Lawrence. Translation, Community, Utopia. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 482-502.

**Additional required readings for graduate students:**

- Asad, Talal. The Concept of Cultural Translation in British Social Anthropology. *Genealogies of Religion. Discipline and Reasons of Power in Christianity and Islam*. Baltimore & London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993, 171-199.

**Recommended readings:**

- Brisset, Annie. The Search for a Native Language: Translation and Cultural Identity. Translated by Rosalind Gill and Roger Gannon. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 337-368.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. The Politics of Translation. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 369-388.
- Derrida, Jacques. What Is a "Relevant" Translation? Transl. by Lawrence Venuti. *The Translation Studies Reader*. Lawrence Venuti (ed.). 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge, 2002: 423-446.

## X. Mar. 17, 2014: Into English

### Required readings for all:

- Griffiths, Paul J. Buddhist Hybrid English. *The Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 4, 2 (1981): 17-32.
- Bingenheimer, Marcus. Collaborative Edition and Translation Projects in the Era of Digital Texts. *Translating Buddhist Chinese. Problems and Prospects*. Konrad Meisig (ed.). Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010: 21-43.

### Additional required readings for graduate students:

- Pollock, Sheldon. Philology, Literature, Translation. *Translating, Translations, Translators from India to the West*. Enrica Garzilli (ed.). Cambridge: Department of Sanskrit and Indian Studies, Harvard University, 1996: 111-129.

### Recommended readings:

- Bucknell, Roderick. Taking into Account the Indic Source-Text. *Translating Buddhist Chinese. Problems and Prospects*. Konrad Meisig (ed.). Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010, 45-52.
- Cabezón, José Ignacio. Comparison as a Principle of Knowledge and its Application to the Translation of Tibetan Texts. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995, 59-74.
- Dreyfus, George. Upon Translating Philosophical Terminology. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995: 168-176.
- Napper, Elizabeth. Styles and Principles of Translation. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995: 35-42.
- Lindtner, Christian. Editors and Readers. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995: 193-204.
- Wilson, Joe Bransford. Problems and Methods in the Translation of Buddhist Texts from Tibetan. *Buddhist Translation: Problems and Perspectives*. Lama Doboom Tulku (ed.). New Delhi : Manohar, 1995: 148-167.

## XI. Mar. 24, 2014: Translation practiced

### Required readings for all:

- Norman, Kenneth Roy (transl.). II, 4. Great Good-Fortune. In *The Rhinoceros Horn and Other Early Buddhist Poems*, transl. by K.R. Norman. With Alternative Translations by I.B. Horner and Walpola Rahula. Oxford: Pali Text Society, 44-45.
- Hallisey, Charles. Auspicious Things. In *Buddhism in Practice*, ed. by Donald S. Lopez, Jr. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995. 312-413.
- Khoroché, Peter. The Tigress. In *Once the Buddha Was a Monkey. Ārya Śūra's Jātakamālā*, transl. by Peter Khoroché. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989, 5-9.
- Speyer, J.S. The Story of the Tigress. In *The Jātakamālā or Garland of Birth-Stories of Āryaśūra*, transl. by J. S. Speyer. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982 (reprint of London: 1895), 2-8.
- Gómez, Luis O. The Way of the Translators: Three Recent Translations of Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra*. *Buddhist Literature* 1 (1999): 262-329.

### Recommended readings:

- Batnitzky, Leora. Translation as Transcendence: A Glimpse into the Workshop of the Buber-Rosenzweig Bible Translation. *New German Critique*, 70, Special Issue on Germans and Jews (Winter, 1997): 87-116.
- *A Guide to the Bodhisattva Way of life: Bodhicaryavatara, by Santideva*. Translated from the Sanskrit and Tibetan by Vesna A. Wallace and B. Alan Wallace. Snow Lion Publications Ithaca, New York, 1997. [http://info.stiltij.nl/publiek/meditatie/leraren/\\_historisch/shantideva-bodhicaryavatara-wallace.pdf](http://info.stiltij.nl/publiek/meditatie/leraren/_historisch/shantideva-bodhicaryavatara-wallace.pdf)



- Ramanujan, A.K. On Translating a Tamil Poem. *The Collected Essays of A.K. Ramanujan*. Vinay Dharwadker (general ed.). Oxford; Oxford University Press, 1999: 219-231.

## **XII. Mar. 31, 2014: Translations discussed**

In-class presentation and discussion of completed student translations.