

Fall 2008

Causation and Time in Buddhist Scholastic Debate

RLG463H1F / NEW433H1F

Time: Mondays, 2-4 pm

Place: SS 2101

Instructor: Christoph Emmrich

Email: christoph.emmrich@utoronto.ca

Office: Erindale Room, Centre for the Study of Religion, 123 St. George St.

Office hours: on appointment

A. Guidelines

Course description

Starting from Sharon Stone's recent notorious comment that the Szechuan earthquake was due to the bad karma accumulated by the Chinese for their occupation of Tibet, the course will analyze the basic Buddhist doctrines of karmic retribution and conditioned co-arising, explore how the idea of causation and its implications for models explaining the temporal character of the impermanent have shaped the course of Buddhist thought across schools and throughout the various phases of Buddhist intellectual history in South Asia as well as modern Western readings of Buddhism.

Requirements

This course will be conducted as a seminar. In order to be graded, students must prepare the reading assignments in due time, attend classes regularly, participate actively in the sessions, give one presentation and submit one essay.

The weekly reading assignments consist of a book or a series of articles covering a specific topic which must be read ahead of the session in which this topic will be discussed. Please check the Course Calendar below to find out which book or articles should be prepared for each session. Additionally, a minimum of 2 questions or critical remarks relating to the material read should be prepared for each session. Students will be expected to raise these questions or make these remarks and confront other members of the class.

Additionally, the participants are expected to initiate the discussions in class by presenting a short paper of 20 min. max. on a topic of their choice based on the assigned readings. Please check the Course Calendar below to find out which topic you would like to present. It is possible to share such a presentation with a fellow student. The presenting students will be responsible for the programme and the moderation of the discussion during that particular session. Those students who will not present during that session are expected to prepare and raise at least 2 points per session, based on the assigned readings. Alternatively to a paper it will be possible for those with Sanskrit or Tibetan language skills to present their annotated translation in one of the sessions where the specific language skills of the students coincide with those of relevant primary sources making the original text accessible to those without the specific language skills. For the translation and presentation of texts other than the ones mentioned in the syllabus please talk to the instructor.

For the final take home-essay (10-12 pages) students should choose one from among various topics which should be proposed, discussed and specified after around mid-term. Students may suggest a theme according to their individual interests. This could be a particular text they have found challenging, a question which has come up in one of the readings, presentations, talks or discussions, or a topic you would like to explore more in detail.

The research essay has to be turned in on the final day of class, i.e. Dec. 1, 2008, both in an electronic format and as a printout. It should be addressed to christoph.emmrich@utoronto.ca. For quick identification, the mail header should mention the course designation in some form or the other. Preferably use your @utoronto.ca account. If you feel unsure about the proceedings of your work or about how to approach it, book a meeting with the course instructor or send him a draft which can be used to advise you. However, keep in mind the deadline, so that you are able to react in time. The course instructor will be glad to offer assistance in deciding on the relevant topic, material or method and discuss your thoughts and writing.

It is crucial for written assignments that everything you produce has been either formulated by yourself or marked and referenced as a quotation if you use materials you have taken from a source. As UofT has adopted a firm stance on the issue of plagiarism, please be aware that, if detected, the course instructor has the duty to report them to university authorities.

There will be no exams, quizzes or tests.

Evaluation

1. regular attendance and the active and informed participation in class: 25 %
2. in-class presentation(s): 30 %
3. one final research essay of 10-12 pages, i.e. ca. 2500 words: 45%

Course grading scheme

A+	90-100%	B+	77-79%	C+	67-69%	D+	57-59%
A	85-89%	B	73-76%	C	63-66%	D	53-56%
A-	80-84%	B-	70-72%	C-	60-62%	D-	50-52%
F	0-49%						

Interaction with the course instructor

Address all your requests and queries about the course to the course instructor. The mail header should identify the course so that your mail can be quickly identified. Though incoming mails are viewed on a daily basis and though the course instructor will try to address your issues as swiftly as possible, it may take up to three days for him to reply to your mail, so do wait for that period before reacting and do mail in time if you have any urgent requests. Prearrange meetings by email so that they can be scheduled upon request.

Recommended preparation: RLG 206Y1/ RLG 206H5 (2L:M2-4)

Recommended accompanying reading

- Kern, S. *A Cultural History of Causality. Science, Murder Novels, and Systems of Thought.* Princeton, 2004.
- Levine, R.V. *The Geography of Time. The Misadventures of a Social Psychologist, or How Every Culture Keeps Time Just a Little Bit Differently.* New York, 1997.

B. Schedule and topics

1. Introductions

1. Sept. 8, 2008 Introduction

2. Sept. 15, 2008 Questions of continental, analytic and non-Buddhist Ancient South Asian philosophy. Buddhist literature on causation and time.

2. Causation

3. Sept. 22, 2008 Causation 1: The Nikāya texts

Required primary reading:

- Suttanipata , Aṭṭhakavagga, sutta 11 (Sn 862-877). In *Buddha's Teachings, Being the Sutta-Nipata or Discourse Collection*. Edited in the Original Pali Text with an English Version Facing It by Lord Chalmers. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1932; 204-209.
- *The Sūtra of the Foundation of the Buddhist Order (Catuspariṣatsūtra). Relating the Events from the Bodhisattva's Enlightenment up to the Conversion of Upatisya (Śāriputra) and Kolita (Maudgalyāyana)*. Translated by Ria Kloppenborg. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1973; 1-17.
- Mahavagga 1,1,1-1,1,3; 1,6,17-1,6,29. In *Vinaya Texts*. Translated from the Pāli by T.W. Rhys Davids and Hermann Oldenberg. Vol. 1. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1885 (Reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982); 73-78; 94-97.
- Cūḷasakuludāyi Sutta. The Shorter Discourse to Sakuladāyin. Majjhima Nikāya 79, 1-8 (MN II 31-33). In *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha. A Translation from the Majjhima Nikāya*. Translated from the Pāli by Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi. Oxford: The Pali Text Society; Somerville, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1995 (Revised 2001), 654-656.
- Mahātaṇhāsankhaya Sutta. The Greater Discourse on the Destruction of Craving. Majjhima Nikāya 38, 1-41 (MN I 256-271). In *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha. A Translation from the Majjhima Nikāya*. Translated from the Pāli by Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi. Oxford: The Pali Text Society; Somerville, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1995 (Revised 2001), 349-361.

Required secondary reading:

- Frauwallner, Erich. *History of Indian Philosophy*. Vol. 1. Translated from the Original German into English by V.M. Bedekar. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1973; 145-169.

Recommended further reading:

- Johansson, Rune Edvin Anders. *The Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism*. London: Curzon, 1979.
- Wayman, Alex. Buddhist Dependent Origination. *History of Religions*, 10, no. 3, (Feb., 1971): 185-203.
- Gómez, Luis O. Some Aspects of the Free-Will Question in the Nikāyas. *Philosophy East and West*, 25, no. 1, (Jan., 1975): 81-90

4. Sept. 29, 2008 Causation 2: The Theravāda

Required primary reading: Conditioned co-arising and condition in the Visuddhimagga:

- Visuddhimagga 17 (Vm 517-441). In Buddhaghosa. *The Path of Purification: Visuddhimagga*. Translated by Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli. Vol. 2. Boulder, CO: Shambhala Publications: 1976; 592- 622.

Required secondary reading:

- Causation in the Pāli canon: Jayatilleke, K.N. *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1963; 443-459.

Recommended further reading:

- Jayatilleke, K.N. *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1963.
- Causal Conditions in the Abhidhammatthasamgaha: AAS 8, 1-43. *Summary of the Topics of Abhidhamma and Exposition of the Topics of Abhidhamma*. Translated by R.P. Wijeyaratne and Rupert Gettin. Lancaster; The Pali Text Society, 2007; 285-324.
- Prayudh Payutto, Phra. *Buddhadhamma: Natural Laws and Values of Life*. Translated by Grant A. Olson. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995; "What Is the Life Process?"77-177.

5. Oct. 6, 2008 Causation 3: The Sarvāstivāda

Required primary reading:

- Conditioned co-arising in the Abhidharmakośa: AK 3, 20a-38c.

Required secondary reading:

- Cox, Collett. Dependent Origination: Its Elaboration in Early Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma Texts. *Researches in Indian and Buddhist Philosophy. Essays in Honour of Professor Alex Wayman*. Ram Karan Sharma (ed.). Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1993; 119-141.

Recommended further reading:

- Willemsen, Charles, Bart Dessein, Collett Cox. *Sarvāstivāda Scholasticism*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1998.

6. Oct. 20, 2008 Causation 4: The Yogācāra

Required primary reading:

- Conditioned Co-arising in Abhidharmasamuccaya: Kritzer, Robert. *Rebirth and Causation in the Yogācāra Abhidharma*. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Buddhistische Studien der Universität Wien, 1999; 21-66.

Required secondary reading:

- Stcherbatsky, Theodor. *Buddhist Logic*. Vol. 1. St. Petersburg 1932 (Reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1992); Chapter II, Causation: 119-145.

Recommended further reading:

- Franco, Eli. Prajñākaragupta on pratīyasamutpāda and Reverse Causation. In Brigitte Kellner, H. Krasser, H. Lasic, M.T. Much, H. Tauscher (eds.), *Pramāṇakīrtiḥ. Papers Decated to Ernst Steinkellner on the Occasion of His 70th Birthday*. Part 1. Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 70.1. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien der Universität Wien, 2007, 163-185.
- Kritzer, Robert. *Rebirth and Causation in the Yogācāra Abhidharma*. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Buddhistische Studien der Universität Wien, 1999.

- Yoshimizu, Chizuko. Causal Efficacy and Spatiotemporal Restriction: an Analytical Study of the Sautrāntika philosophy. In Brigitte Kellner, H. Krasser, H. Lasic, M.T. Much, H. Tauscher (eds.), *Pramāṇakīrtiḥ. Papers Decated to Ernst Steinkellner on the Occasion of His 70th Birthday*. Part 1. Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 70.1. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien der Universität Wien, 2007; 1049-1078.

7. Oct. 27, 2008 Causation 5: The Madhyamaka

Required primary reading:

- Conditions and conditioned co-arising in Kalupahana, David J. *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā of Nāgārjuna. The Philosophy of the Middle Way. Introduction, Sanskrit Text, English Translation and Annotation*. Albany, NY: State Univeristy of New York Press, 1986 (Reprint: Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1991, 1996, 1999); Examination of Conditions (Pratyaya-parīkṣā): 105-117; Examination of the Conditioned (Saṃskṛta-parīkṣā): 159-179.

Required secondary reading:

- Garfield, Jay L. Nāgārjuna's Theory of Causality: Implications Sacred and Profane. *Philosophy East and West*, Vol. 51, No. 4, Nondualism, Liberation, and Language: The Infinity Foundation Lectures at Hawai'i, 1997-2000, (Oct., 2001): 507-524

Recommended further reading:

- Chinn, Ewing. Nāgārjuna's Fundamental Doctrine of Pratīyasamutpāda. *Philosophy East and West*, 51, no. 1(Jan., 2001): 54-72.
- Garfield, Jay L. Dependent Arising and the Emptiness of Emptiness: Why Did Nāgārjuna Start with Causation? *Philosophy East and West*, 44, no. 2, (Apr., 1994): 219-250.
- Kalupahana, David J. Causality. *The Central Philosophy of Buddhism*. Honolulu: The University of Hawai'i Press, 1975.

2. Time

8. Nov. 3, 2008 Time 1: The Nikāya texts

Required primary reading:

- Untimely. (Akkhaṇā[suttaṃ], AN IV 225,22–228,14). In *The Gradual Sayings*. Vol. IV, Translated by E. Hardy from the Aṅguttara Nikāya. Oxford: Pali Text Society, 1899; 152-155.
- Bhaddekaratta Sutta, An Single Excellent Night. Majjhimanikāya 131 (Bhaddekarattasuttaṃ paṭhamam, MN III 187,13–189,25). In *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha. A Translation from the Majjhima Nikāya*. Translated from the Pāli by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi. Oxford: The Pali Text Society; Somerville, MA: Wisdom Publications, 1995 (Revised 2001), 1039-1041.
- Pathways of Language. Saṃyutta Nikāya, 62,10 (Niruttipatha[suttaṃ], SN III 71,13–73,7). In *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha. A Translation from the Saṃyutta Nikāya* by Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000; 905-906.
- Life's Brevity. Aṅguttara Nikāya 7,70 (Araka[suttaṃ], AN IV 136,17–139,27). In *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha. An Anthology of Suttas from the Aṅguttara Nikāya*. Translated and edited by Nyanaponika Thera and Bhikkhu Bodhi. Delhi: Vistar Publications, 2000, (Originally published Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1999); 193-195.
- Samiddhi. Saṃyutta Nikāya 20,10 (Samiddhisuttaṃ, SN I 18,8–20,5). In *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha. A Translation from the Saṃyutta Nikāya* by Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000; 97-100.

Required secondary literature:

- Bronkhorst, Johannes. akālika in the Buddhist Canon. *Studien zur Indologie und Iranistik* 10 (1985), 187–189.
- Collins, Steven. Nirvana, Time and Narrative. *History of Religions*, 31(3), 215–246.

(Recommended) further reading:

- Emmrich, Christoph. *The Short, the Long and the Right Time. Temporal Expressions of World and Liberation in the Suttapiṭaka*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Heidelberg, 2004.

9. Nov. 10, 2008 Time 2: The Sarvāstivāda

Required primary reading:

- Mil 2,2,9-2,3,3 (Milindapañha. PTS. 49-52) *The Questions of King Milinda*. Translated from the Pāli by T.W. Rhys-Davids. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1890; 77-82. [PDF at <http://www.archive.org/details/questionsofkingm028266mbp>]
- AKBh 5, 25-27 and AKBh 3,78-93. **804-820 and Vol. II 470-481?**. [PDF of French original at <http://www.archive.org/details/labhidharmakosat04vasuuoft>]

Required secondary reading:

- Bastow, David. The Mahā-Vibhāṣā Arguments for Sarvāstivāda. *Philosophy East and West*, 44, no. 3 (Jul., 1994): 489-499
- Cox, Collett. *Disputed Dharmas. Early Buddhist Theories on Existence. An Annotated Translation of the Section on Factors Dissociated from Thought from Saṅghabhadra's Nyāyānusāra*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 1995; Chapter 9, The Four Characteristics of Conditioned Factors, 9.1, Sarvāstivāda Ontology, 133-158.

Recommended further reading:

- Louis de La Vallée Poussin. La controverse de temps et du pudgala dans le Vijñānakāya. *Etudes Asiatiques* (1925), 343–376; Louis de La Vallée Poussin. Notes sur le moment ou kṣaṇa des bouddhistes. *Rocznik Orientalistyczny*, 7 (1934), 1–9.; Louis de La Vallée Poussin. Document de l'Abhidharma: La controverse du temps III Notes sur le moment (kṣaṇa) des Vaibhāṣikas et des Sautrāntikas. *Mélanges chinois bouddhiques*, 5 (1937), 7–158. All in *Essays on Time in Buddhism*. Edited by H.S. Prasad. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, 1991; 79-112; 147-298.
- Sinha, Braj M. *Time and Temporality in Sāṃkhya-Yoga and Abhidharma Buddhism*. Delhi 1983.

10. Nov. 17, 2008 Time 4: The Madhyamaka

Required primary reading:

- Mūlamadhymakakārikā 19, Kāla-parīkṣā. Kaluphana, David J. *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā of Nāgārjuna. The Philosophy of the Middle Way. Introduction, Sanskrit Text, English Translation and Annotation*. Albany, NY: State Univeristy of New York Press, 1986 (Reprint: Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1991, 1996, 1999); Examination of Time (Kāla-parīkṣā): 275-279.

Required secondary reading:

- Kalupahana, David J. The Buddhist Perception of Time and Temporality. *Philosophy East West*, 24 (Apr. 1974), 181-191.

Recommended further reading:

- Mūlamadhymakakārikā 2, Gatāgata-parīkṣā. Kaluphana, David J. *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā of Nāgārjuna. The Philosophy of the Middle Way. Introduction, Sanskrit Text, English Translation*

and Annotation. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1986 (Reprint: Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1991, 1996, 1999); Examination of The Moved and the Not-Moved (Gatāgata-parīkṣā): 118-131.

11. Nov. 24, 2008 Time 3: The development of the *kṣaṇīkavāda* and its apologetics in Yogācāra

Required primary reading:

- Proof of Momentariness in the Hsien-yang. von Rospatt, Alexander. *The Buddhist Doctrine of Momentariness. A Survey of the Origins and Early Phase of this Doctrine up to Vasubandhu*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1995; 219-248.

Required secondary reading:

- Dreyfus, Georges B.J. *Recognizing Reality. Dharmakīrti's Philosophy and Its Tibetan Interpretations*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1997; Dharmakīrti's Ontology. Momentariness and the Structure of Dharmakīrti's System, 60-72.
- Gupta, Rita. The Buddhist Doctrine of Momentariness and its Presuppositions. Dharmakīrti's Argument in the Hetubindu. *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 8 (1980): 47-68.

Recommended further reading:

- Gupta, Rita. *Essays on Dependent Origination and Momentariness*. Calcutta 1990.
- Laine, Joy. Udāyana's Refutation of the Buddhist Thesis of Momentariness in the Ātmatattvaviveka. *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 26 (1998): 51-97.
- von Rospatt, Alexander. *The Buddhist Doctrine of Momentariness. A Survey of the Origins and Early Phase of this Doctrine up to Vasubandhu*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1995
- Stcherbatsky, Theodor. *Buddhist Logic*. Vol. 1. St. Petersburg 1932 (Reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1992); The Theory of Instantaneous Being: 77-118.

12. Dec. 1, 2008 Time 5: The Theravāda Abhidhamma apologetics; conclusions

Required primary reading:

- The Ti-sankhata-lakkhana. In Kim, Wan Doo. *The Theravādin Doctrine of Momentariness. A Survey of its Origins and Development*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oxford, 1999; 258-260.
- The refutation of the all-encompassing doctrine of momentariness. The Khaṇīkathā of the Kathāvatthu and its commentary(Kv 620,7-621,22; Kv-a 198,14-29). In Kim, Wan Doo. *The Theravādin Doctrine of Momentariness. A Survey of its Origins and Development*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oxford, 1999; 263-266.
- Of Everything as Persistently Existing. Kathāvatthu 1,6. (Sabbamatthīkathā, Kv 115,28-143,30). In *Points of Controversy, or Subjects of Discourse, Being a Translation of the Kathāvatthu from the Abhidhamma-Piṭaka* by Shwe Zan Aung and Mrs. Rhys Davids. Oxford: The Pali Text Society, 1915 (Reprint 1993): 84-104.

Required secondary reading:

- Ven. Nyanaponika Thera. *Abhidhamma Studies. Buddhist Explorations of Consciousness and Time*. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1998 (Originally published Colombo: Frewin & Co. Ltd., 1949); 93-114.

Recommended further reading:

- Bastow, David. Debates on Time in the Kathāvatthu. *Buddhist Studies Review*, 13,2 (1996), 109-132.

- Brown, Jason W. Microgenesis and Buddhism: The Concept of Momentariness. *Philosophy East and West*, 49, 3 (July, 1999): 261-277.
- Collins, Steven. *Selfless Persons. Imagery and Thought in Theravāda Buddhism*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1982; Chapter 7-8: 199-161.
- Kim, Wan Doo. *The Theravādin Doctrine of Momentariness. A Survey of its Origins and Development*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Oxford, 1999